



Minutes

Meeting:	TriMet Board of Directors Regular Board Meeting	Date:	February 24, 2016
		Time:	9:00 a.m.
Presiding:	Bruce Warner	Location:	City of Portland Building 1120 SW Fifth Avenue Auditorium Portland, Oregon 97204
Board Members Present:	Lori Irish Bauman T. Allen Bethel Joe Esmonde Craig Prosser Travis Stovall Bruce Warner	Board Members Absent:	Shelley Martin

TriMet Board Business meetings and public forum are available via web video stream. You can access the archived meetings and materials at trimet.org/meetings/board.

President Warner called the business meeting to order at 9:27 a.m.

1. The following Board Committee Report was provided:

- A. **Finance and Audit Committee** – Director Prosser reported that the Committee met this morning and received updates on: 1) budget preview; 2) fund balance policy; 3) financial forecast annual update; and 4) regional strategy update.

2. General Manager Report

A. **GM Comments** - Neil McFarlane reported on:

- Transit Driver Appreciation Day on March 18, 2016
- January Ridership Results
- Naming of Physical Assets Policy
- Refunding Bonds

- B. **Quarterly Performance Report** – Doug Kelsey reported on the fourth quarter results of the performance indicators and answered Board questions. (Report distributed to the Board, public and is available online.)

3. Consent Agenda

Action: T. Allen Bethel moved to approve the consent agenda items listed below; Travis Stovall seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Approval of Board Meeting Minutes for January 27, 2016

Resolution Directing that the Reading of all Ordinances be By Title Only

Resolution 16-02-10 Adopting a Revised Unrestricted Fund Balance and Contingency Policy

Resolution 16-02-11 Authorizing a Contract with Computer Technology Link for the Purchase of Agency Computers and Peripherals

4. Resolutions

Neil McFarlane introduced the following resolutions:

Resolution 16-02-12 Authorizing Application to ODOT for Discretionary Special Transportation Funding Based on Special Transportation Fund Advisory Committee Recommendations

Director Prosser asked for a more detailed description for the \$2.2 million allocation for Ride Connection.

Alan Lehto responded that Ride Connection has a variety of services that fills in the gaps for special transportation needs in the region that was detailed on the submitted application. Mr. Lehto stated that in the future staff would provide a more detailed summary.

Director Bethel asked why Ride Connection receives the majority of funds and expressed concern that other agencies would become dependent on one group.

Alan Lehto explained that Ride Connection is a non-profit agency that provides a series of services that takes pressure off of our LIFT service by providing over 400,000 rides annually. TriMet helped launch Ride Connection years ago and the purpose of the agency is to help coordinate service for seniors and persons with disabilities in the region to ensure that transportation is well-planned ensuring available funds are used in the most efficient way. Ride Connection has been a national model and works with our partners to provide a valuable service.

Neil McFarlane stated that staff will ask Ride Connection to provide information at a future briefing on their partnerships and programs. Mr. McFarlane added that we receive a lot of mileage on the coordination that Ride Connection provides that helps stretch available dollars.

President Warner stated that he is a great supporter of Ride Connection and looks forward to hearing about the partnerships and programs in place.

Action: Joe Esmonde moved approval of Resolution 16-02-12; Lori Irish Bauman seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Resolution 16-02-13 Authorizing a Contract with Zimmer Gunsul Frasca Architects LLP for Design Services for the Westside Bike and Ride Bike Parking Project

Director Bethel asked if we could use the same plan as we did for the Beaverton Transit Center and save money.

Neil McFarlane stated that we will need a unique plan for Goose Hallow to match the station architecture and area surroundings. What the two plans do have in common is the overall program on how we use the site, the layout, and security precautions. One of the tasks included in this project is to provide standard specifications for future projects.

Action: T. Allen Bethel moved approval of Resolution 16-02-13; Craig Prosser seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Resolution 16-02-14 Board of Directors, Acting in its Capacity as the TriMet Contract Review Board, Exempting from Competitive Bidding Requirements a Contract for Design, Furnish and Install Services for the CCTV-Based Intrusion Detection Project

Director Stovall stated that TriMet has been very successful in doing this type of procurement in the past and is confident in our track record, but does want to understand for clarity of transparency how we determine which projects are exempt from competitive bidding requirements.

Neil McFarlane stated that we do have a lengthy checklist that we go through, along with a public hearing and findings before recommending for Board approval. Mr. McFarlane stated that staff would be happy to provide an overview on that process.

Action: Joe Esmonde moved approval of Resolution 16-02-14; Travis Stovall seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

5. Ordinance 342 An Ordinance of the Tri-County Metropolitan Transportation District of Oregon (TriMet) Adopting Electronic Fare Program and Proof of Fare Payment Provisions, and Amending TriMet Code Chapters 19 and 29 (Second Reading)

General Counsel Shelley Devine read Ordinance 342 by title only.

The following people spoke on Ordinance 342 during public forum:

Michelle Zellers, TriMet rider and a member of OPAL and Bus Riders Unite (BRU), spoke on Ordinance 342 and stated that she and other BRU members spent time on transit talking with people about TriMet Administration's plan for eFare. Ms. Zellers stated that while many passengers support eFare, many shared OPAL's equity concerns and believe that transit should be shaped by users and asked that the Board ensure that any new system is family friendly, inclusive of low-income people and safe for communities of color.

David Bouchard spoke on Ordinance 342 and stated that the design and implementation of eFare is an exciting development and has great potential, but what is of concern to OPAL is the lack of group and low-income fares for eFare and shared that there are transit agencies across the country that provide these fares and talked about the benefits that these valuable options would provide. (Written testimony provided and made part of this Board record.)

Orlando Lopez read written testimony from Zoemy Tuz and Lucia Llanos Pinos regarding Ordinance 342 that is included in this Board record and suggested that TriMet hold meetings at a time when working people can attend.

Neil McFarlane stated that today's second reading and vote of Ordinance 342 will put into policy changes needed to fully realize the electronic fare system's potential. The policies, impacts and our mitigation efforts are well balanced taking into consideration equity, business needs, and the overall impact to our customers. As you have heard, we have done quite a bit of outreach to communities who may be affected most by our e-fare system.

Neil McFarlane responded to comments made during public forum on Ordinance 342:

- In response to the request for a family fare, Mr. McFarlane noted that because of the individual price caps proposed, this would be difficult to implement. We currently have individual fares, so the implementation of eFare would not change this. If in the future the Board would like to consider multiple use cards we would then need to consider cap provisions and how it would be implemented.
- Mr. McFarlane stated that the public and the Board have expressed interest in a low-income fare. Research is currently under way led by John Gardner, Director of Diversity and Transit Equity, to look at the experiences of other transit districts and how it would impact the expanding system.
- While retail outlets are an important part of reloading cards, there are many opportunities to pay including the ability to load your card by phone. Neil McFarlane noted that Chris Tucker is continuing to work with Plaid Pantry with the hope to merge technology that would broaden the retail network.

Mr. McFarlane added that today's action would begin the process of establishing the rules of the road for eFare and then we can begin the broader outreach that is included as part of the proposed budget. This process is a building block that we can continually improve on over time.

Director Prosser stated that it was mentioned during public testimony that an individual was hoping that the retail network would be expanded to include neighborhood stores that were primarily Hispanic so that they could explain how to use the card. Director Prosser stated that he imagined that the retailers would sell/reload cards, but not be responsible for teaching people how to use them.

Neil McFarlane stated that Director Prosser is correct, that while some markets are more full service than others, the primary job of the outlet is to sell or reload the card. It will be important to work with partners to provide a variety of outreach and bi-lingual opportunities to teach people how to use the cards.

President Warner asked when eFare will be operational.

Neil McFarlane stated that we will set an implementation schedule based on the results of the integrated lab testing that will be done at the end of next month. Currently, we estimate that eFare would be operational January 2017.

President Warner stated that one concern we have heard is about the security of information provided in the system, and asked what changes we have made based on that feedback.

Neil McFarlane stated that we appreciated the feedback and that customers will have the option of registering with an alias and an ID number so they can have the benefit of fare capping, but still remain anonymous.

President Warner asked for an explanation of what fare capping is.

Neil McFarlane explained that the system will determine the best fare for a customer. Once a customer has paid the cost of a day pass or the cost of a monthly pass, the system shows that the customer is paid up respectively. This essentially allows a customer to buy the fare one day at a time while getting the benefit of a monthly pass. The other benefit of eFare is loss protection. If the card is registered, and then if the card is lost, we can transfer the available funds to another card based on information and contact from our customer. Neil McFarlane noted that other benefits include faster boarding for our customers and easier identification of fares for our operators.

Present Warner asked that if people do not have a card and only cash, how will that work once the system is implemented.

Neil McFarlane explained that all our current vending machines still take cash for the purchase of ticket products and that cash will still be taken at the fare box with transfers issued. Once the market determines there is no longer a demand for cash purchases, we would do another equity analysis to determine what permanent changes need to be made.

Director Stovall asked what the financial impact of fare capping would be to the agency.

Neil McFarlane stated that our financial forecast is based on eFare being in place and asked Chris Tucker to share specific details.

Chris Tucker responded that fare capping on a monthly basis is a new concept and the model we looked at in Canada felt that fare capping was of minimal concern and estimated 1 to 1-1/2% of lost fare revenue due to fare capping and that is what we have planned for. As the eFare system ramps up, we will see other gains due to faster boarding, reduction in cash purchases and maintenance of TVMs.

Director Stovall stated that as he has shared before, he is a huge proponent of poverty to prosperity and is excited to see that fare capping will benefit low-income riders to the tune of \$1 to 1-1/2 million annually. TriMet has been a top innovator nationally and hope we can continue that as we consider a family pass. As has been discussed, there are many options available to reload cards outside of the retail outlets, and Chris Tucker confirmed that 80% of TriMet riders use smart phones and that we have estimated that roughly 25-30% of our riders will use retail network to reload cards.

Chris Tucker stated that over time the use of smart phones will increase and as we have seen with TVM usage since the implementation of electronic fare, the use of retail networks will decrease.

Director Prosser stated that one issue that has been raised is the initial cost of the card at \$3.00 with a minimum \$5.00 load and the hardship that would be on low-income riders.

Chris Tucker stated that TriMet will work with social service agencies and other partners to distribute 200,000 free cards to low-income riders.

Director Stovall stated that although there are many options to reload cards, he would like to see as many retail outlets as possible, including Plaid Pantries. Director Stovall stated the importance of education during the roll-out of this system.

President Warner stated that the Board has seen the outreach that has been done to the potentially affected communities of these policy changes and have heard from community members through various channels including last month's public hearing. Our Transit Equity Advisory committee reviewed and also provided comments on the January 6, 2016 Equity Analysis that was done. The Board was

briefed on the analysis at its January 13th briefing and endorsed its findings at our January 27th meeting. Staff will continue outreach and education as we move towards implementation of eFare.

Director Stovall stated that this is a critical step moving forward for the region and our riders and we have been very deliberative and responsive to the comments received and would like to reiterate the importance of stepping out to be a leader in the concept of a family pass and to continue to be open to new ideas and innovation.

Director Bethel asked that those who would like us to consider the idea of tapping one card for all family members spend energy looking at the implications of the family pass and offer suggestions and proposed solutions on how to implement, not just offer why we need to have one. Although we can't promise to implement all or any of the suggestions, we can promise to continue considering innovative ways to be the best transit agency in the nation.

President Warner stated that he supports this ordinance that would benefit all riders and improve our current fare system in an innovative way. President Warner stated that he is looking forward to learning more about what other agencies have done with low-income and family fares and partnering with advocates on mitigation efforts.

Action: Travis Stovall moved approval of Ordinance 342; T. Allen Bethel seconded the motion.

The following roll call vote resulted in the approval of Ordinance 342:

Craig Prosser.....	Yes
Lori Irish Bauman.....	Yes
Travis Stovall.....	Yes
Bruce Warner.....	Yes
T. Allen Bethel.....	Yes
Joe Esmonde.....	Yes

6. Other Business & Adjournment

There was no further business to come before the Board

President Warner adjourned the meeting at 10:55 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Kelly Runnion, Recording Secretary

Good morning. My name is David Bouchard, and I live near Portland State University, where I am finishing my Bachelor's degree. I am passionate about mass transit, and use many bus and MAX lines on a daily basis to visit friends, go to meetings, and attend classes. The design and implementation of e-fare is an exciting transit development for this region, and it has great potential. However, like any major capital project, nothing is perfect. Of particular concern is the lack of low-income and group fares for FastPass. These options are very important for many of us who rely on the transit system to get anywhere. Transit agencies around the country are already providing low-income fares, such as Seattle, San Francisco, Denver, Chicago, Cincinnati, and Kansas City. Salt Lake City's Utah Transit Authority also provides group fares for families. Many of these cities also have e-fare. These fare options would help many of us afford to get around without the stress of wondering whether or not we can afford our next bus. It would be a huge help to parents or other groups travelling together to pay for everyone's trip with just one tap of the card, rather than four or five people fishing out their cards. It could also help buses to stay on schedule by reducing the dwell time caused by large groups tapping multiple cards. Low income and group fares are a win-win for everyone, and we urge you to provide these valuable options to your riders.

Hello my name is Zoemy Tuz and I live in Northeast Portland. I use the #4, 15, 72, and the Max to get to doctor appointments for my kids, to go to school, to pay bills, and to run errands. My husband is the only one that drives and we only have enough to maintain just one car. He uses his car to go to work, therefor my kids and I depend on the TriMet services. One of my concerns is that the closest stores takes 18 minutes walking alone and it would take much longer if I were to walk there with my kids it would take much longer. This would cause me lo miss my preferred bus times and it will take much longer to do the activities that I have planned for that day. I cannot imagine how the elderly or people with disabilities would have to manage to have access to the services in the area where I live. TriMet should consider some of the local stores that are close to where we live including the Mexican stores where they can explain how to use the services and that can help us register our cards anonymously. TriMet needs to do more outreach, I only learned about the upcoming changes through a meeting with Latino Network but they didn't have enough information. I know of many families who depend of the transit services but are unaware of the coming changes. I would like for TriMet to consider a family card, carrying multiple cards and keeping track of the funds in all of them would be difficult. It would be much easier to only have to carry one card and keep track of the funds in that way. One last thing that I would like TriMet to consider is implement a low income fare.

Hello and thank you for the opportunity to present my testimony. My name is Lucia Llanos Pinos and I live in Southeast Portland. I use the lines number 9, 15, 72, 75, and the Max. I use the transit system to go to Church, shopping, doctor visits, pay bills, go to school, and run errands. I don't have a car and I don't know how to drive therefore I must rely on public transportation. My husband is the only one who has a car and can drive but he cannot help us when he is at work. One of the concerns that I have with the new system is that although people can register the cards anonymously many folks will not know about this option and provide their personal information. How do we know that you will not share this information with other agencies such as ICE? Does TriMet have policies that will prevent them from sharing this information? Another concern that I have is that the retail network is very limited. The closest place to where I live is almost 11 blocks which would be difficult when I have to walk with my youngest child. The closest store is a Plaid Pantry only 4 blocks away. I would also like for TriMet to implement a low income fare, everywhere we go the rent is too high and we shouldn't worry if we have enough to catch the next bus. Please take these thoughts into consideration.